

**NIALS JOURNAL
OF
SUPREME COURT
REVIEW**

2011

**NIALS Journal
of
Supreme Court Review**

Cited as:

(2011) Vol. 1 NJSCR

ISSN:



Published by
Nigerian Institute of Advanced Legal Studies
Prof. Epiphany Azinge, SAN
Editor-in-Chief

Shankyula Tersoo Samuel
Assistant Editor

Editorial Board

1. Prof. C.O. Okonkwo, *SAN*
2. Prof. Charlse Ilegune
3. Prof. Obiorah Okafor
4. Prof. Dakas C.J. Dakas
4. Prof. Demola Popoola
5. Prof. Ignatius Ayua, *SAN*

Contents

	Pages
<i>Editorial Note</i> - - - - -	v
	ii

<i>Longe v. First Bank of Nigeria Plc; a Review of the Corporate Governance Issues Revisited by the Supreme Court</i>	-	Dr. A.A. Akume-	-	-	-	-	-	-	106-127
The Death Penalty in the Supreme Court of Nigeria: A Critical Evaluation of Hurilaws' Constitutional Challenges of the Nineties	-	Dr. Solomon Ukhuegbe	-	-	-	-	-	-	128-203
<i>General Index</i>	-		-	-	-	-	-	-	204-212

Editorial Note

In 2010, the Institute commenced a journey of publication of law report dubbed NIALS APPELLATE COURT LAW REPORT which is on going till now.

The Institute has now thought it wise to provide a platform which will allow academics and the general legal community to ventilate their views, comments and opinions

on the judgment passed by the highest court of the land-the Supreme Court of Nigeria.

The views expressed by authors in the journal are not intended to serve as appeal over the judgments of the Supreme Court. It is expected that the comments and views expressed by respected academic and practitioners are objective and will be considered as such. Those views are also those of the authors and do not represent the views of the Institute.

The NIALS Journal of Supreme Court Review (NJSCR) will be bi-annual and it is hoped that it will meet its objective of being of useful relevance to the Judges at all levels and the legal community in general in appreciating new perfectives on legal principles which may appear settled by the Supreme Court.

This edition has a total of seven reviewed cases bothering on Criminal Law, Land Law, Insurance, Corporate Governance, Arbitration and Tenancy.

Professor Epiphany Azinge, SAN
Director-General
2011.

Table of Cases

Nigerian Cases

<i>Adamu Kumo v. The State</i> (1967) 1 All NLR 289.....	23
<i>Adebayo v Brown</i> [1990] 3NWLR (PT 141) 661, Pg 683	48
<i>Adejumo v. David Hughes & Co Ltd</i> [1989] 5NWLR (PT120) 146.....	60
<i>Adisa v. State</i> (1991) 1 NWLR (pt 168) 490 at 496.....	12
<i>Aga v. State</i> (1976) 7 S.C. 173.....	182

<i>Agusto v. Joshua</i> [1962] 1 ALL NLR 312.....	44
<i>Ahmadu Lado v. The State</i> (1999) 9 NWLR (Pt. 619) 369.....	32
.....	<i>Ajax v. Aina</i>
[1967] Lagos LR 152.....	46
<i>Aliu Bello v. Attorney General of Oyo State</i> (1986) 5 NWLR 828.....	200
<i>August Duru v. The State</i> (1993) 3 NWLR (Pt. 274) 283	25
<i>Awe v. Saidi</i> [1969] 1 All NLR 477.....	61
<i>Awobiyi v. Igbalaye Brothers</i> [1965] NSCC 123.....	61
<i>Awojugbagbe Light Industries Ltd v. Chinukwe</i> [1995] 4NWLR (PT 390).....	379
<i>Bachon Bookshop Ltd. v. Njemanze</i> {1977} IMSLR 126.....	44
<i>Bala James Ngillari v. National Insurance Corporation of Nigeria</i> (1998) 6 SCNJ 16	1
<i>Bello v. The State</i> (1968)1 All NLR 361.....	24
<i>Bernard Longe v. First Bank of Nigeria PLC</i> (2001) ALL FWLR PT 525, P258; (2006) 3 NWLR, PT 967, PG 228; (2010) P294, PARAGRAPH B.....	108, 110; .111, 113, 115, 117, 118, 121,122
<i>Bucknor-Maclean v. Inlaks Nig. Ltd</i> (1980) 8-11 SC 1.....	5
<i>Centaploy Ltd v. Matlodge Ltd</i> [1971] 1Ch 1.....	46
<i>Coker v. Adeyemo</i> [1968] NMLR 323.....	44
<i>Diala Amako v. The State</i> (1995) 6 SCNJ 23.....	28
<i>DPP v. Chike Obi</i> (1961) 1 SCNLR 197.....	186

<i>Duru v. Onwumehu</i> (2001) 18 NWLR (Pt. 746) 672 at 694- 695.....	22
<i>Erasmus Osawe v. Registrar Trade Unions</i> (1985) 1	NWLR
755.....	195
<i>Fahm v. Ogbojulongun</i> (1935) 12 NLR 47.....	44
<i>Federal Housing Authority v. Sommer</i> [1986] 1 NWLR (PT 17) 533; [1992] 1NWLR (PT 219) 548 (SC).....	94
<i>Frank Uwagboe v. The State</i> (2008) 4 SCNJ 459	39
<i>Gambo Musa v. The State</i> (2009) 7 SCNJ 329	39
<i>Idemudia v. The State</i> (1999) 7 NWLR (Pt.610) 202....	26
<i>Isaac v. Hotel de Paris</i> [1960] 1All ER 348.....	59
<i>Jaiyeoba v. Akinbo</i> [1959] WNLR 299.....	57
<i>Kalu v. The State</i> (1998) 13 NWLR 531.....	148
<i>Kuruma v. R</i> (1955) AC 197 (Privy Council).....	187
<i>Mbanengen Shande v. The State</i> (2005) 6 SCNJ 124.....	18,19,21,31 ,34
<i>Moorgate Mercantile Co. Ltd v. Twitchings</i> (1976) 1 QB 225 at 241.....	22
<i>Motayo v. Nigerian Fibre Industries Co Ltd</i> (1974) 4 ECSLR 570.....	46
<i>MV Lupex v. Nigerian Overseas Chartering and Shipping Limited (Suit No. SC 21/2000)</i> (2003) 15 NWLR (pt 844) 469.....	1
<i>National Bank of Nigeria Ltd v. Adedeji</i> (1989) 1 NWLR (Pt. 96) 212.....	11
<i>NIDB v. Olalomi Industries Ltd</i> (2002) 5 NWLR (Pt. 761) 532.....	23
<i>Niger Progress limited v. North East Line Corporation</i>	

(1983) 3 NWLR (pt 107) 68.....	8
<i>Nigeria LNG Limited v. African Development Insurance Co. Ltd.</i> (1995) 8 NWLR (pt 416) 677 @ 695 para	
H.....	9
<i>Odutola v. Papersack (Nigeria) Limited</i> {2006} 18 NWLR (PT 1012) PG 470.....	42, 46, 47, 48,49, 50,51,54, 58, 61
<i>Ogbebor v. Union Insurance Co. Ltd</i> (1967) NCLR	
377.....	5
<i>Ogugu v. The State</i> (1994) 9 NWLR (pt. 366) 1 At 40.....	137,147,155
<i>Okeke v. A-G Anambra State</i> (1992) 1 NWLR (Pt. 215)	
164.....	22
<i>Okorodudu Taylor</i> [1970] MSNLR 38.....	54
<i>Oladipupo v. The State</i> (1993) 6 SCNJ 233.....	24
<i>Olale v. Ekwelendu</i> [1989] 4NWLR pt (115) 326.....	44
<i>Olorun- Nimbe v. Lucas</i> [1963] 2All NLR 189.....	56
<i>Omeninu v. The State</i> (1966) NMLR 356.....	27
<i>Oyeludun v. Shomoye</i> [1960] WNLR 126.....	44
<i>Pan Asian African Co Ltd v. National Insurance Corporation of Nigeria</i> [1982] All NLR 229.....	45
<i>Peenock Investments Ltd v. Hotel Presidential Ltd</i> (1973) 3 ECCLR	
109.....	48
<i>Peter Nemi v. Attorney General of Lagos State</i> (1996) 6 NWLR (pt. 452) 42.....	148,157
<i>Pharmatek Industrial Projects Ltd v. Trade Bank (Nig) Plc & Ors</i> , Appeal No. CA/IL/71/2007 delivered on 27 th day of March 2009 (Coram: Sankey, Agube, Nweze JJCA.....	25

<i>Queen v. Egbe</i> (1961) 1 All NLR 476.....	24
<i>Queen v. Jinobu</i> (1961) 1 All NLR 627 @ Pg 629	24
<i>R v. Duffy</i> (1949)1 All WLR 93.....	21
<i>R v. Dummemi</i> (1955) 15 W.A.C.A 75.....	28
<i>R v. Edache</i> (1962) NMLR 56	23
<i>R v. James Adekanmi</i> (1944) 17 NLR 99 @ 101	29
<i>R v. John Okoro</i> (1942) 16 NLR 63 @ 65	29
<i>Ransome-Kuti v. Attorney General</i> (1985) 2 N.S.C.C 879 at 918.....	189
<i>Rufai v. Olugbeja</i> [1986] 5NWLR (PT 40) 162.....	44
<i>Savannah Bank Ltd v. Ajilo</i> (1989) 1 NWLR (Pt. 97) 305..	2
<i>Solanke v. Abed</i> (1962) 1 SCNLR 371.....	11
<i>State v. Makawanyne & Anor</i> (1995) 3 SA 391 at 33 (CC).....	176
<i>Suleiman Danta Annabi v. The State</i> (2008) 5 SCNJ 136.....	24,39
<i>Sunmonu v. Onayemi</i> (1955) 21NLR 45.....	44
<i>U.B.N. v. Ayodare</i> (2007) 4 K.L.R. (Pt. 235) 2022.....	26
<i>Udih v. Izedonmwun</i> [1990] 2NWLR (PT 132) 357.....	55
<i>Ugochukwu v. Co-operative & Commerce Bank Nig. Ltd</i> (1996) 6 NWLR (Pt 456) 524.....	11
<i>Uluebeka v. The State</i> (2000) 7 NWLR (Pt.665) 404	30
<i>Union Bank of Nigeria Plc & Anor v. Ayodare & Sons</i> (Nig.) Ltd (2007) 13 NWLR (Pt. 1052) 567.....	2
<i>United Nigerian Insurance Co. Ltd v. Fadco Industries</i> <i>Nigeria Ltd</i>	6
<i>University of Nigeria Nsukka v. Turner & Sons</i> (1968) 1 A.L.R Comm 29.....	8
<i>Unokan Enterprises Ltd v. Omuvwie</i> [2005] 1 NWLR (PT 907) 293.....	43

Foreign Cases

<i>A Juvenile v. The State</i> (1989) 2 Zimb L. Rep. 61.....	139
<i>A.G, Canada v. Lavell</i> (1974) S.C.R 1349.....	19
<i>Abbott v. Attorney General of Trinidad and Tobago</i> (1979) 1 WLR 1342.....	156
<i>Bachan Singh v. State of Punjab</i> A.I.R (1982) S.C 1325 at 1332.....	184
<i>Bachan Singh v. State of Punjab</i> A.I.R 1980 SC 898 at 945.....	177
<i>Bedder v. DPP</i> (1954) 2 All ER 801	30
<i>Boucher v. R</i> (1951) S.C.R 265.....	186
<i>Boyce & Joseph v. R</i> (2005) 1 AC 400.....	175
<i>Boyer v. Warbey</i> [1953] 1 QB 234.....	46
<i>Canadian Council of Churches v. Canada</i> (<i>Minister of Employment and Immigration</i>) (1992) 1 S.C.R 236 at 256.....	195
<i>Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe v.</i> <i>Attorney General</i> (1993) 1 ZIMB.L REP 242.....	156
<i>Coker v. Georgia</i> (1977) 433 U.S 584.....	176
<i>Consolidated Project Ltd v. The Owners of the Tug</i> “ <i>DE PING</i> ” January 10,2000: A/CN.9/SER.C/ABSTRACT 140, (2000) HKCFI 27.....	13
<i>Croft v. Lumley</i> 5 E&B 648, PG 680; 119 ER 622.....	56
<i>Emmund v. Florida</i> (1982) 458 U.S 782.....	183
<i>Far East Mercantile Co Ltd v. Jackie Philips Photos Ltd</i> (1974) 4 ECSR 668.....	43
<i>Fox v. The Queen</i> (2002) 2 A.C 284.....	181
<i>Gregg v. Georgia</i> (1976) 428 U.S 153.....	176
<i>Guerra v. Baptise</i> (1996) AC 397.....	160

<i>Hampshire v. Wickens</i> (1878)7Ch D 555.....	54
<i>Hand v. Hand</i> (1877) 2 Ex D 355.....	53
<i>Henfield v. Attorney General of the Commonwealth of the Bahamas</i> (1997) AC 413, (1996) 3 WLR 1079.....	160
<i>Hilaire v. Trinidad & Tobago</i> decided 21 June 2002 para 108.....	181
<i>In Coopers and Lybrand Ltd (Trustee) for BC Navigation SA (Bankrupt) v. Canpotex Shipping Services Ltd: November 2 1997 A/CN.9/SER.C?ABSTRACTS/1 16 FEDERAL TRIAL REPORTER 79.....</i>	13
<i>Jopling v. Jopling</i> (1909) 8 Commonwealth LR 33.....	54
<i>Kathleen Byrne v. Ireland</i> (1972) I.R. 241.....	193
<i>Kushner v. Law Society</i> [1952] 1 All ER 404.....	53
<i>Lace v. Chantler</i> [1944] KB 368.....	54
<i>Macaura v. Northern Assurance Co Ltd</i> [1925] AC 619...43	
<i>Matthew v. The State</i> (2005) 1 AC 433.....	175
<i>Mc Kellar and Westerman Ltd v. Rosemary Down Eversfield</i> (1994) A.D.R.L.J 140	10
<i>Mint v. Good</i> [1951] 1KB 517,521.....	52
<i>Mithu v. State of Punjab</i> A.I.R (1983) SC 473 at 476....	176
<i>Navionics Inc v. Flota Maritima Mexicana SA:January 17,1989 A/CN.9/SER.C/ABSTRACTS/1:26 FEDERAL TRIAL REPORTER 148.....</i>	13
<i>Ncube v. The State</i> (1987) 2 Zimb L. Rep. 246.....	139
<i>Noble Assurance Co and others v. Gerling-konzen General Insurance Co-UK Branch</i> (2007) EWHC 253.....	10,11
<i>Ocalan v. Turkey</i> (2003) 37 E.H.L.R 238 at	

para 198.....	168
<i>Ong Ah Chuan v. Public Prosecutor</i> (1981) A.C 648.....	181
<i>Oxley v. James</i> (1844) 153 ER 87.....	53
<i>Parker v. Taswell</i> (1858) 27 LJ Ch 812.....	53
<i>Pratt v. Attorney General for Jamaica</i> (1994) 2 AC 1.....	156,157
<i>R v. MCarthy</i> (1952) 2 Q.B. 112.....	30
<i>R v. Hughes</i> (2000) 2 AC 259.....	175
<i>R v. Martineau</i> (1990) 2 S.C.R 633.....	181
<i>R v. Vaillancourt</i> (1987) 2 S.C.R 636.....	182
<i>Re North and South Insurance</i> (1993) 4 LILR 356.....	8
<i>Reckley v. Minister of Public Safety and Immigration</i> (No.2) (1996) AC 527	160
<i>Regina v. Miller & Cockriell</i> (1977) 2 SCR 680.....	180
<i>Reyes v. The Queen</i> (2002) 2 A.C 235.....	181
<i>Riley v. Attorney General of Jamaica</i> (1983) 1	AC 719..... 156
<i>Roberts v. Louisiana</i> (1976) 428 U.S 325.....	180
<i>Roodal v. The State</i> (2004) 2 WLR 652.....	175
<i>Rosetanni v. R</i> (1963) S.C.R 651.....	198
<i>Runyowa v. R</i> (1967) AC 26, (1996).....	168,175
<i>Salomon v. Salomon & Co, Ltd</i> [1897] AC 22.....	43
<i>Soering v. United Kingdom</i> (1989) 11 E.H.R.R 439.....	155
<i>State v. Williams</i> (1995) 3 SA 632.....	139
<i>Street v. Mountford</i> [1985] 2 All ER 289, <i>Samrose</i> <i>Properties Ltd v. Gibbard</i> [1958] 1 All ER 502	57
<i>The State v. Petrus</i> (1985) L.R.C.....	139
<i>Tooker v. Smith</i> (1857) 156 ER 1396.....	60
<i>Tyer v. United Kingdom</i> (1978) 2 E.H.R.R 1.....	139
<i>Walsh v. Lonsdale</i> (1882) 21 Ch D 9.....	53
<i>Watson v. R</i> (2004) 1 AC 472.....	175

Woodson v. North Carolina (1976) 428 U.S 280.....180

Table of Statutes

Nigerian Statutes

Criminal Procedure Act Cap C41 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria.....	133
Criminal Procedure Code.....	133
Evidence Act Cap E14 LFN 2004; ss. 136, 137(1), 150..	19
Insurance Act 1997.....	11
Insurance Act, Cap 117 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria 2004.....	1
Land Tenure Law 1962.....	44
Land Use Act 1978.....	18
Nigerian Criminal Code Cap. C38 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria 2004.....	132
Nigerian Penal Code Cap. P3 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria 2004.....	132,133
Robbery and Firearms (Special Provisions) Act 1970.....	141
Schedule to the Delegation of Military Governor's Power	

Notice No. 4 of	
1978.....	16
Section 10 Conveyancing and Law of Property Act	
1881.....	
....	44
Section 1 and 2 of the Statute of Frauds 1677.....	52
Section 152 Evidence	
Act.....	44
Section 19(1) Insurance Act	
2004.....	5
Section 19(1)(2)(3), Insurance	
Act.....	5
Section 19(2), Insurance	
Act.....	5
Section 19(3), Insurance	
Act.....	5
Section 19, Insurance Act	
2004.....	10
Section 19, Insurance Act	
2004.....	11
Section 2 Property and Conveyancing Act 1959.....	59
Section 2 Recovery of Premises	
Law.....	52
Section 21(b) and 22, Land Use Act LFN 2004.....	5
Section 22 Land Use Act	
1978.....	44
Section 22(1), Land Use Act LFN	
2004.....	10
Section 22(2) Land Use Act LFN	
2004.....	5
Section 220 Penal Code Law Cap. 89 Laws of	
Northern Nigeria	
1960.....	17
Section 221 Criminal Code.....	141
Section 221(1) Penal Code Law Cap. 89 Laws of	

Northern Nigeria	
1960.....	23,24
Section 222(1) Penal Code Law Cap. 89 Laws of Northern Nigeria	
1960.....	31
Section 227 Criminal Code.....	141
Section 24, Marine Insurance Act	
2004.....	10
Section 24, Marine Insurance Act, 2004.....	11
Section 244 (1) Companies and Allied Matters Act	
CAP C20 LFN 2004.....	114, 115, 120
Section 26, Land Use Act Cap L5 LFN 2004.....	2
Section 262 (1) Companies and Allied Matters Act	
CAP C20 LFN 2004.....	113, 121, 122, 123, 124, 125
Section 266 Companies and Allied Matters Act CAP C20 LFN.....	2004...110, 118, 119
Section 266 Penal Code Law Cap. 89 Laws of Northern Nigeria	
1960.....	33
Section 283 Criminal Code Act, Cap C38 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria	
2004.....	22
Section 284 Criminal Code Act, Cap C38 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria 2004.....	22, 33
Section 3 Real Property Act	
1845.....	52
Section 3, Marine Insurance Act Cap M2 LFRN,	
2004.....10
Section 31(1) 1979 Constitution FRN.....	129
Section 316 Criminal Code Act, Cap C38 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria 2004	
.....	17

Section 318 Criminal Code Act, Cap C38 Laws of the Federation of Nigeria	
2004.....	25
Section 319 Criminal Code.....	141,166
Section 33(6)(C) 1999 Constitution FRN.....	137,166
Section 34(1) 1999 Constitution FRN.....	129,133
Section 34(1), (4) Land Use Act... LFN	
2004.....	12
Section 35 1999 Constitution FRN.....	134,135, 136, 138
Section 36 1999 Constitution FRN.....	134,136
Section 367 Criminal Procedure Act.....	140
Section 368 Criminal Procedure Act.....	140
Section 37 Criminal Code.....	141
Section 38 Criminal Code.....	141
Section 38 Landlords and Tenants Law 1986.....	52
Section 38 Penal Code Law Cap. 89 Laws of Northern Nigeria	
1960.....	23
Section 38 Penal Code Law Cap. 89 Laws of Northern Nigeria	
1960.....	34
Section 385 Criminal Procedure Act.....	138
Section 386 Criminal Procedure Act.....	138
Section 387 Criminal Procedure Act.....	138
Section 4 of Arbitration and Conciliation Act, 1990	
.....	5,10,12
Section 4(1) of the Arbitration and Conciliation Act , 1990	
.....	14,15
Section 4(2) of Arbitration and Conciliation Act, 1990.....	6,1
4,15	
Section 40 Criminal Procedure Code.....	135
Section 41 (3); 63 (1); 282 (4) Companies and Allied	

Matters Act CAP C20 LFN 2004.....	112, 124, 125
Section 45, Land Use Act LFN 2004.....	16
Section 5 of Arbitration and Conciliation Act ,1990.....	9,10
Section 5(1) of Arbitration and Conciliation Act ,1990.....	6
Section 5(1), 2(a)(b), Marine Insurance Act Cap M2 LFRN 2004.....	10
Section 5(2) of Arbitration and Conciliation Act ,1990.....	6
Section 58 (2) of the Arbitration and Conciliation Act,1988.....	13
Section 58(2) Insurance Act 2004.....	5
Section 58, Insurance Act.....	6
Section 63 (1) of Companies and Allied Matters Act CAP C20 LFN Section 64(b, 65 of Companies and Allied Matters Act CAP C20 LFN 2004.....	106
Section 79 Property and Conveyancing Law 1959.....	52

Foreign Statutes

1899 Queensland Criminal Code.....	131
Indian Penal Codes.....	131,133
Sudan Penal Codes.....	131

Treaties

Foreign Treaties

Article 11.3 of the 1958 New York Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards.....	12
Article 2 of the European Convention.....	129
Article 3 European Convention on Human Rights.....	166

Article 37(a) Convention on the Rights of the Child.....	140
Article 6(5) International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.....	140
European Convention for the Protection of Human and Fundamental Freedoms 213 U.N.T.S 221, E.T.S 5, U.K.T.S.71 (1953).....	133
European Convention in Soering.....	167
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.....	163
Section 7 of UNCITRAL Model Law on International Commercial Arbitration 1985.....	11,12,14,16
UNCITRAL Model Law on International Commercial Arbitration 1985.....	4

